



The Two Nations Theory and It's Role In The Establishment of Pakistan

Davut Şahbaz*

ORCID: 0000-0002-0236-2908

Abstract

The two nation theory is based on the hypothesis that Muslims differ from Hindus in terms of religious, cultural, social and daily life and that they must establish an independent Muslim state in which they can live freely their identities. Syed Ahmad Khan was the first to theorize the two nation theory and to encouraged Muslims to support it. The two nation theory was developed by Muhammad Iqbal and Chaudhry Rahmat Ali, and moreover, they offered suggestions on the borders and the name of the Muslim state that should be established under the two nation theory. Muhammad Ali Jinnah was the one who completed the missing aspects of the two nation theory and made it the basis for the establishment of Pakistan. In the light of the two nation theory, Pakistan was established as a new power in South Asia on 14th August 1947 as a result of these determined and faithful theoretical and practical efforts. The purpose of this study is to understand how and under which conditions the two nations theory, which are assumed to be the theoretical background of Pakistan, emerged, and to comprehend which important names shape this theory. This study was created as a result of examining the basic historical studies in the libraries of state universities in Pakistan and postmodern historical sources.

Keywords: Two Nations Theory; Pakistan; India; Indian Muslims; Independence

Received Date: 10/02/2020

Accepted Date: 25/03/2020

* Doctor, Ankara University, Faculty of Language, History and Geography, Department of Eastern Languages and Literatures, Sub-Department of Urdu Language and Literatur, E-Mail: dsahbaz@ankara.edu.tr.

İki Ulus Teorisi ve Teorinin Pakistan'ın Kuruluşundaki Rolü

Davut Şahbaz

ORCID: 0000-0002-0236-2908

Öz

İki ulus teorisi, Müslümanların dini, kültürel, sosyal ve günlük yaşam açısından Hindular'dan farklı olduğu ve kimliklerini özgürce yaşayabilecekleri bağımsız bir Müslüman devlet kurmaları gerektiği hipotezine dayanmaktadır. Seyyid Ahmed Han, iki ulus teorisini kuramlaştıran ve Müslümanları bu teoriyi desteklemeye teşvik eden ilk kişidir. İki ulus teorisi Muhammed İkbâl ve Chodri Rahmat Ali tarafından geliştirilmiş, dahası bu isimler iki ulus teorisi kapsamında kurulması gereken Müslüman devletin sınırları ve adı hakkında önerilerde bulunmuşlardır. İki ulus teorisinin eksik yönlerini tamamlayan ve bu teoriyi Pakistan'ın kuruluşunun temeli haline getiren isim Muhammed Ali Cinnah'dır. İki ulus teorisi ışığında, bu kararlı ve sadık teorik ve pratik çabaların sonucunda Pakistan, 14 Ağustos 1947'de Güney Asya'da yeni bir güç olarak kurulmuştur. Bu çalışmanın amacı, Pakistan'ın kuramsal altyapısı olduğu varsayılan iki ulus teorisinin nasıl ve hangi şartlarda ortaya çıktığını anlamak, hangi önemli isimlerin bu teoriyi şekillendirdiğini kavramaktır. Bu çalışma, Pakistan'daki devlet üniversitelerinin kütüphanelerindeki temel tarihi çalışmaların ve post modern tarihi kaynakların incelenmesi sonucu oluşturulmuştur.

Anahtar Sözcükler: İki Ulus Teorisi; Pakistan; Hindistan; Hindistan Müslümanları; Bağımsızlık

Gönderme Tarihi: 10/02/2020

Kabul Tarihi:25/03/2020

Теория двух наций и ее роль в создании Пакистана

Резюме

Теория двух наций основана на гипотезе об отличии индусов от мусульман по своим религиозным взглядам, культуре, социальной и бытовой жизни, что вызывает необходимость создания последними собственного независимого мусульманского государства, где они смогут свободно практиковать свой жизненный уклад. Саид Ахмадхан был первым, кто сформировал теорию из идеи двух наций и сподвиг мусульман на ее поддержку. Мухаммад Икбал и Чаудхури Рахмат Али же не только развили ее дальше, но и начертили границы и предложили имя государства, которое будет образовано в рамках данной теории. Дополнил эту теорию и сделал ее основанием для образования Пакистана Мухаммад Али Джинна. В свете данной теории, в результате решительных и верных теоретических и практических усилий 14 августа 1947 года в Южной Азии появилось новое государство Пакистан. Целью данного исследования является изучение условий и путей появления, как принято считать, лежащей в основе создания государства Пакистан теории двух наций, а также изучение вклада определенных исторических лиц в ее формировании. В нашем исследовании были использованы работы из библиотек государственных университетов Пакистана и современные исторические источники.

Ключевые слова: теория двух наций; Пакистан; Индия; индийские мусульмане; независимость

Получено: 10/02/2020

Принято: 25/03/2020

Introduction

The Ideology of Pakistan is based on the hypothesis that Muslims of India must live in an independent Muslim state based on the belief that they have a different culture, civilization, traditions, tradition, literature, language, religion and way of life to distinguish themselves from other nations in India. The distinctive feature of the Pakistani ideology, which differs from the ideological structures of the other world states established by the division, is that the concept of religion is the basis of the vast majority of the differences we have mentioned and that the ideology is built on the distinctive elements arising from this concept. Dr. Roopesh Chaturvedi emphasized that there is no other state in the world similar to the founding phase of the Pakistani ideology built on these religious-based differentiations.¹ This ideological discourse, which foresees a model of state in which Islam is accepted as a ruling mind and dominated by the cultural and social order prescribed by Islam, has been transformed into a structure that will form Pakistan's founding manifesto by nurturing from historical developments. Over the religious differences that started with the acceptance of Islam by the people of India and which were the main factors under almost every conflict until the division process, were added social, economic, political and cultural divisions in time, and soon this situation was realized by the two opposite polar nations as Hindu and Muslim. Under the influence of increasing Hindu nationalism during the British sovereignty period, Muslims focused on reversing the environment in which they began to live as a minority through discourses of nationalization. It is assumed that the idea of establishing an independent Muslim state in the Indian Sub-continent was born and matured as a result of religious, political, cultural, linguistic, economic, educational and social interactions between Muslims and Indian local people during the first conquest campaigns by Muslim Arabs to India. Assuming that the state is merely a product of thought with conceptual validity, and we make a reasoning by adopting Burdeau's conclusion that 'the state exists because people think of it'² the beginning of Pakistan's

¹ Roopesh Chaturvedi, "The Partition of Indian sub-continent: Problems and Literary Prospects," *Journal of Humanities and Social Science* 17, sy. 2 (2013):39.

² Münci Kapani, *Politika Bilimine Giriş*, Ankara: Bilgi Yayınevi, 2009, 38.

adventure in the Sub-Continent, we can clearly say that the ideology of Pakistan began when the religion of Islam began to be accepted on the subcontinent. The people of India, who came into contact with Islam and later accepted Islam as their religion, began to separate their fellow Hindus from the Hindus, and then believed that building a different state was the right decision for them. The historical origins of Pakistan's rise to the world stage by building on a religion-based theory of independence would be appropriate to be sought at a time when Islam became the religion and lifestyle of the Indian indigenous people. Since the 6th century, Muslim Arabs have made attempts to conquer the Indian Sub-Continent, where they have carried out economic activities first. Arab merchants, who transported the products of South India to Europe via Egypt, have made significant financial gains from this business. The conquest of Makran, which was conquered during the time of Hazrat Osman, was adjacent to India's Sindh region, which enabled India to be recognized by Muslims. After Muhammad Bin Qasim conquered Debal in 711 and then gained strategic land gains in the cities of Neron, Sasam and Sevistan, the process of multifaceted interaction between Arabs and Indian civilization began. There have been significant changes in the cultural, economic and political structure of India with the entry and positioning of Muslims in the region.³ The most important of these changes was the change in the belief system that would affect the future of the Sub-Continent. As a result of the caste system existing in Hinduism, the local people who were not from the privileged caste of this system and had to regulate their life according to the requirements of the caste to which they belonged in all periods of life were affected by the understandable, egalitarian and fair structure of Islam and consequently they became Muslims in masses. The position of Islam as a religious and social system in the Sub-Continent led to the formation of two nations that adopted this religion over time and preferred to reinterpret life according to the requirements of this religion or did not abandon their religion. These two societies, which have differentiated in terms of religion, have started to differentiate in their cultural and daily lives which are shaped in line with the jurisprudence of these religions. Thus, two major nations emerged on the Sub-Continent, which are diametrically opposed. In the 19th and 20th centuries, empires collapsed in the world and replaced by nation-states and the popularity of nationalist movements increased. As

³ Yahya Amjad, *Tarih-i Pakistan Vasti Ehed*, Lahor: Sang-e Meel Publications, 1997, 14.

a result of these international developments, Muslims in India have sought a goal in which they can freely live their religions and get rid of the political and social sanctions of the British holding the country.

“The freedom movement in Indo-Pakistan subcontinent can be properly understand in its proper historical perspective. The Muslims entered India as brave conquerors and victors from west and north west. Muhammad Bin Qasim marched with the crecent in 712 A.D over Sind and established Muslim rulestretching up to Multan. Infact the establishment of Muslim rule by Mohammad Bin Qasim was the embryo of Pakistan”⁴

Two Nations Theory as the Basic Political Theory of Indian Muslims and Leading Names Shaping the Theory

The British took over the political and economic management of the Indian Sub-continent through the East India Company, which they established in 1600 to pursue commercial activities. During their monopolistic rule in India, the British, who tried to establish close relations with Hindu and other ethnic groups rather than Muslims, easily prevented the Muslim freedom movement that they started in 1857 and then minimized their economic, political and educational relations with this society. This situation condemned Muslims to very bad living conditions, the Muslims who had been dominating the region for centuries were removed from public duties, prevented from carrying out economic activities and their right to education was restricted. These heavy and aggressive practices against Muslims paved the way for this society to become conscious and organized. These developments triggered Muslim nationalism. Another development that led to the emergence of Muslim nationalism is that the Hindus, who started to lose the practice of living together with Muslims and tried to protect themselves and their religions with Islam becoming a rival religion to their own religions, began to adopt a nationalist structure. Increasing Hindu nationalism among the Hindus has gradually become a threat to Muslims. This was one of the factors that enabled the rise of Muslim nationalism. The theory of the two nations, which form the basis of the ideals of independence of Indian Muslims, is considered a difficult concept

⁴ Abdul Majid vdğr., “Genesis of the Two Nations Theory and the Quaid-e-Azam”, *Pakistan Vision Journal* 15, sy.1 (2014):181.

to define and comprehend because of the geographic dynamics it contains. Therefore, it is important to explain the concepts of nation and nationalism that constitute the core of this theory, taking into account the local characteristics of the region. Because, when the studies that try to explain the concept of nation and suggest the theories about how a nation is formed, the following definition is generally accepted about whom to call nation:

“a group of people with a union of language, history, emotion, ideal, tradition and custom is called nation”⁵

According to this theory, the main source of the formation of the nation, which we call Indian Muslims, was religion, and differentiation from Hindus in terms of tradition-custom, emotion, ideology, history and language took place on the ground created by the vision of life drawn by Islam. Therefore, the Indian nation's two-nation theory is unique in that it encompasses both the concepts of general nation definitions and the structure of a new nation, which is based on the concept of religion. The theory of the Two Nations, which is seeded by the desire to establish a free state in India, is nurtured by the cultural, linguistic, political, religious, economic and social differences between the two communities living together in a fundamental sense. These fundamental differences divide the two societies and form two different nations. The most important of these differences is undoubtedly the difference of belief between the two communities. The fact that Islam and Hinduism are two major religions that cannot influence or swallow each other, and that the peoples of these religions are not able to produce common religious values, invalidates the necessity of coexistence in time, and both communities have found the idea of dividing freely to perform religious rituals.

Professor Nezir Ahmed Tishna categorized the basic aims of the Pakistani ideology and the theory of the two nations and the principles of the state in the founding manifesto of Pakistan as follows:

a. Efforts to Define a Muslim Nation

⁵ a group of people with a union of language, history, emotion, ideal, tradition and custom is called nation, sozluk.gov.tr/ (11.11.2019).

- b. A desire for life dominated by Islamic order
- c. The desire to establish a Republican state shaped according to Islamic rules
- d. Willingness to form an Islamic government
- e. The desire to establish a social structure constructed with a policy of respect for minorities and tolerance to humanity
- f. The hope of freedom
- g. The desire to create a unified Islamic nation
- h. The desire to build a social order dominated by Islamic culture and traditions.⁶

It would be useful to have a clear understanding of the pioneering politicians who have been able to look at the development of the stage of the theorization and application of the theory of the two nations, which have enabled the Indian Muslims to gather around the idea of nationalism and theorizing the process of the establishment of Pakistan.

It has been expressed by different names in different channels that India should be divided and Muslims should be described as a nation that cannot be melted in the same pot as any other ethnic group. For example, the idea of a free state belonging to Muslims is often seen in the discourses of Syed Cemaluddin Afghani, who has the ideology of Pan-Islamism. Cemaluddin Afghani developed a proposal for a state model covering Northern India and Afghanistan, which seemed quite utopian according to the conditions of the period. Moulvi Abdul Halim Sharar, one of the most important writers of Urdu literature, has inferences that Muslim and Hindus cannot live together and that two separate states should be established. Sociologists, politicians and literary names such as Muhammad Abdul Qadir, Aga Khan, Abdul Jabbar Hayri, Sardar Gul Muhammad and Sir Abdullah Harun have contributed to the ideologies of these two states and two nations with their writings, discourses and studies. It is necessary to open a separate parenthesis to Wilfrid Scawen Blunt, who makes inferences about the borders of the Muslim state, which is foreseen to be established. "It was Wilfrid Scawen Blunt who suggested in Calcutta that in his view practically all the Provinces of Northern India

⁶ Nezir Ahmed Tishna, *Tarih-i Pakistan 1947-2013*, Celum, : Book Corner Publications, 2013, 51-55.

should be placed under Muslim Government and those of Southern under Hindu Government”⁷

However, these non-theoretical discourses in different periods could not go beyond being individual inferences. It was Syed Ahmad Khan who presented the theory of the two nations in a theoretical framework. In line with the conclusions drawn from the Urdu-Hindi discussions that started in the mid-19th century, Syed Ahmad Khan expressed that Hindu and Muslims have too different perspectives to live together.

Syed Ahmad Khan, who stated that the British started the political structuring with the entry to the Sub-Continent and reached a privileged position in the eyes of the British with the reconciliation policies, could not only enter the competition with this unity and solidarity but also instilled the consciousness of the nation to the Muslims in a short time. At the same time, he told the British that Muslims had been one of the most important actors of this geography for centuries, and therefore, like Hindus, should be seen as a nation with its own culture, belief and history. The multi-faceted transformation movement, which Sir Syed Ahmad Khan initiated in the literary, political, economic, cultural and educational fields with the intention of re-establishing Muslims as a political actor in the Sub-Continent, soon spread to large masses. This movement then led Muslims to increase their intellectual level and attempt to produce comprehensive projects on how to build a free and powerful life. Syed Ahmad Khan's inferences that Muslims and Hindus are very different from each other and that the majority of Hindus cannot be represented equally by democratic elections⁸ have placed very important stones on the basis of the theory of the two nations. Syed Ahmad Khan stressed that the democratic elections would benefit only Hindus, who are more than Muslims in terms of population. Ahmad Khan stated that these elections gave the authority to form a government shaped according to the wishes of the majority and this situation was a destruction for Muslims. Syed Ahmad Khan informed the British that the cultural values belonging to Muslims were to be destroyed in the face of the efforts of Hindus to position the Hindi language in place of the Urdu language and at the same

⁷ Khalid Bin Sayeed, *Pakistan the Formative Phase 1857-1948*, Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2019,102-103.

⁸ Kishwar Sultana, *Politics of the All-India Muslim League 1924-1940*, Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2016.

time efforts to expand the use of the Devenagari alphabet instead of the Urdu alphabet. With the idea that the efforts of deliberately pushing the Urdu language into the background and putting the Hindi language in the forefront will bring significant breaks from the cultures of Muslims,⁹ he tried to recognize the Urdu language as the most important element to be claimed by the Muslims, and widespread among the descendants. Thus, Against the attempts of Hindus to ignore Muslims, Syed Ahmad Khan raised awareness of Muslim society by emphasizing two different nations-two different cultures and traditions. Syed Ahmad Khan realizes that the seeds of nationalism are gradually turning into sprouts in Hindu society and warns that this situation will open the gap between Hindu and Muslim communities.¹⁰ Syed Ahmad Khan produced the works listed below in line with his strategy of organizing Muslims and reintegrating the consciousness of nationality into this society and repaired the negative image of Muslim society in the eyes of the British:

1. Rısalah Asbab-ı Baghawat-ı Hind
2. Loyal Muhammadans of India.¹¹

The greatest evolution of the Pakistani ideology after Islam's first penetration into India came about in this process in which Syed Ahmad Khan performed superior works both in the scientific and political and social fields. In addition to political activities, it has enabled the establishment of very important educational institutions. Ahmad Khan's most important achievement in this regard was the establishment of the Muslim-Anglo Oriental School, which in 1877 became a college under the same name, and finally laid the foundation of a university called Aligarh Muslim University. As a result of the profound influence of the college in society, this educational institution established by Ahmad Khan has gone beyond the educational goals and has been instrumental in the development of Muslim nationalism and thus the establishment of the theory of the two nations in the minds of the society. Syed Ahmad Khan, who believes that Muslims can succeed if they stick to the rational structure of Islam¹² has made the positivist understanding of education prevail in Muslim society and enabled Indian Muslims to awaken from their sleep of ignorance. As a result of these

⁹ Nahid Fatima, *Unnisvin Sadi Mein Urdu Zaban*, Delhi: Adabistan Publications, 2012.

¹⁰ Hakan Kuyumcu, *Pakistan Tarihi (1857-1958)*, Konya: Sage Yayıncılık, 2018, 33.

¹¹ Asuman Belen Özcan, *Doğu Kültüründe Anlatı Geleneği: Urdu Nesri*, Ankara: hdy Yayınları, 2012, 54.

¹² Hakan Kuyumcu, "Urducanın Gelişiminde Etkin Olan İlk Batılı Eğitim Kurumları ve Aligarh Hareketi," *Nüsha* VI, sy. 20 (2006): 133-147.

developments, different and independent Muslim state utopias of Muslims gained a realistic quality and Indian Muslims started to gather around a nation consciousness. This conscious organization and national consciousness formed the theory of Two Nations, which is the superstructure of the Pakistani ideology, and led to the preparation of the theoretical framework of the fact that it is a nation with different culture, religion, lifestyle and political tradition that should not be seen as a minority of any other society. Assoc. Dr. Filza Waseem used the following statements about Syed Ahmad Khan's unique contribution to the process of the formation of the Pakistani ideology and to reverse the destiny of a nation by influencing the lives of Indian Muslims:

“Sir Sayyid Ahmad Khan was a pivotal figure in the Indian Muslim renaissance. His life shows how the dedication, hard work and clear vision of a single man can change the destiny of a whole nation. It can be said that it was due to his extraordinary vision that the Muslims of India could regenerate after lapsing into moral despondency, cultural lethargy and educational backwardness. Without him, it might have taken another few centuries for the Indian Muslims to come out of their medievalism to modernism. He sought to reconcile modern scientific thought with religion sensibility and rationalistic interpretations”¹³

Ahmed Khan, who opened the way for the re-appointment of Muslims to important tasks in accordance with the friendly relations he established with the British, also prevented the regression of the Urdu language into a passive position and ensured that Muslims did not lose their language consciousness. Thus, it enabled Muslims to have a say in India's political and social management decisions.¹⁴ The first steps of the theory of the two nations, which can be described as the theorized manifestation of the Pakistani ideology, are based on the Aligarh movement and the personal efforts of Syed Ahmad Khan. Thanks to the revolutionary transformations of Syed Ahmad Khan in various fields, Indian Muslims began to adapt to the new world order and the Aligarh intellectuals who grew up in the educational and political institutions established by Ahmad Khan played an active role in the establishment of Pakistan in the future.

¹³ Filza Waseem, “Sir Sayyid Ahmad Khan and the Identity Formation of Indian Muslims Through Education,” *Review of History and Political Science* 2, sy. 2 (2014):146.

¹⁴ Muhammad Ali Çerağ, *Tarih-i Pakistan*. Lahore: Sang-e Meel Publications, 1996, 190-192.

Muhammad Iqbal, the aim of Syed Ahmad Khan's efforts to establish a theoretical framework for Muslims should be defined as a separate nation, thanks to its superior rhetoric features, both poems and ghazals, as well as enthusiastic speeches spread primarily to the British and Hindus. Thus, Iqbal raised the consciousness of being a nation among Muslims. Although Muhammad Iqbal's understanding of nationalism between 1899-1905 was not based on the independence of India but was based on the independence of India, significant changes occurred in this understanding when he returned from Europe, where he went to study between 1905-1908. With his return to India, Iqbal began to produce ideas for the Qur'an and a state structure synthesized by Islamic living rules. Iqbal stepped up his efforts to serve the awakening of the Muslim community and its transition to the formation of an independent Islamic country. Based on the fact that Islam is not only a religion but also a civilization, Iqbal has made it possible for Muslims to achieve important gains in a short period of time with their studies towards differentiation based on language and religion.¹⁵ Muhammad Iqbal argued that the survival of India's Muslims as a force in India and the continuation of the cultural heritage of Islam is possible only through an Islamic state to be established in India.¹⁶ With this in mind, Muhammad Iqbal was a great step forward in the process of understanding and transmitting the Two Nation theory. During this period, Muhammad Iqbal, who started to use his political features in addition to his literary and scientific features, put forward the idea of a separate and independent state for Muslims both in the meetings of the Muslims and in the meetings of the British and Hindus and started to unite the discourse with the Muslim segment around this idea. Muhammad Iqbal expressed the idea that an independent state should be established according to Islamic rules in India¹⁷ at the annual meeting of the All Indian Muslim Party in Allahabad on 29 December 1930:

“I would like to see the Punjab, North-West Frontier Province, Sindh and Balochistan amalgamated into a single State. Self-government within the British Empire, or without the British Empire, the formation of a consolidated North-

¹⁵ Mustansir Mir, *Iqbal*, Lahor: Iqbal Academy Pakistan, 2008.

¹⁶ Muhammad Ali Çerağ, *Tarih-i Pakistan*. Lahore: Sang-e Meel Publications, 1996.

¹⁷ Harun Alreşid Tabassum, *Felsefe-i İqbal Aor Neya Pakistan*, Faisalabad: Misaal Publishers, 2018.

West Indian Muslim State appears to me the final destiny of Muslims, at least of North India”¹⁸

This speech of Muhammad Iqbal, which defines Muslims as a separate nation and goes further and proposes the boundaries of an independent state for Muslims, soon showed its influence on Muslim politicians and Muslims of India and enabled them to focus on the goals of nation-building. Moreover, he emphasized that the Islamic order in the life, the unity of the Muslims, the importance of the establishment of an Islamic republic¹⁹ have made valuable contributions to the struggle for independence which will accelerate the Muslims in the following periods. Obviously, these meeting speeches, which were thought to provide the philosophical and literary sources of Muhammad Iqbal's theory of the Two Nations in the first sense, were understood to be the raw material of a quality political division plan that a cunning politician could do in the future. Because the basic elements that Iqbal emphasized in his speech in Allahabad were the basis for the founding principles of the Pakistani state in the future.

“It can be said that the portrayal of Pakistan was made by Iqbal before everyone else at the meeting of the Muslim Party in 1930... Iqbal had emphasized the Muslim State here in Northwest India”²⁰

Iqbal not only identified the environment created by the Hindu majority, but also developed a consistent suggestion with these proposals, he managed to establish a national harmony among Muslims. The most important conclusion on which Muhammad Iqbal is based on the idea of forming a religion-based state is that Islam and Hinduism are not only a religion but also a social actor that forms culture. According to Iqbal, although Muslims and Hindus lived together for thousands of years, they were able to create a culture unlike each other and to preserve these cultures without being assimilated. Therefore, according to him, these two nations should be under the roof of two different states where they can preserve their own culture and develop their ideology even more freely. Iqbal's rhetoric and Islamic knowledge quickly adapted the Muslim community to the idea of independence. Thus, the ideology of Pakistan- Two Nation theory began to develop on a ground where politics and society supported each

¹⁸ M.R. Kazımı, *A Concise History of Pakistan*, Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2019, 115.

¹⁹ Vahid Ashrat, *Fikriyat-i İqbal*, Lahore: Sang-e Meel Publications, 2009.

²⁰ Sumit Sarkar, *Cedid-i Hindustan*, çev. Mesud Haşimi, Yeni Delhi: National Council for Promotion of Urdu Language Publications, 2003, 410.

other and the level of influence increased.²¹ Muhammad Iqbal had the idea that if the idea of an Islamic state became reality, not only the problems in India, but almost all of Asia could be solved. He transmitted the fact that India was heterogeneous, composed of many nations, to the British and Hindus. İkbâl argued that the aim of living under one roof without the integrity of the language and religion would bring more harm to the two communities. During a one important meeting, Iqbal addressed the Muslim community, which was directed by the British and was in the process of losing their nationalist identity:

“East, west are free, we are someone else's prey. Our cracker is the capital for the repair of someone else. Our lives are the will of others. This is endless death, not heavy sleep”²²

Muhammad Iqbal has revealed both the idea of an independent Muslim state and the description of contemporary Pakistan in his letters. His letters to Mohammed Ali Jinnah, the savior of Indian Muslims, the founder and immortal leader of Pakistan, give us important clues about the political genius of Iqbal and his contribution to the founding of Pakistan. Some of the themes in these letters are as follows:

- Social and economic findings of the Muslim Movement in India
- The structure and principles of the All India Muslim Party
- A separate and independent state(today's Pakistan) and the future of Islam in India.

These letters, written between May 1936 and November 1937, revealing critical developments for the history of Muslim India, as well as various recommendations to Muhammad Ali Jinnah, are highly valuable in terms of the determination of Iqbal's theory of the two nations and the understanding of Pakistani ideology. Muhammad Ali Jinnah used the following sentences about these letters:

“...I think these letters are of very great historical importance, particularly those which explain his views in clear and unambiguous terms on the political future of Muslim India. His views were substantially in consonance with my own and had finally

²¹ Nezir Ahmed Tishna, *Tarih-i Pakistan 1947-2013*, Celum: Book Corner, 2013, 56-57.

²² Hicabi Kırılgaç, “İkbâl'de Gelecek Tasavvuru ve Ne Yapmalı?” *Hece Aylık Edebiyat Dergisi Boyun Eğmeyen Ateşin Dili Muhammed İkbâl Özel Sayısı* 17, sy. 193 (2013): 267.

led me to the same conclusions as a result of careful examination and study of the constitutional problems facing India, and found expression in due course in the united will of Muslim India as adumbrated in the Lahore resolution of the All-India Muslim League, popularly known as the “Pakistan Resolution,” passed on 23rd March, 1940”²³

Professor Dr. Celal Soydan uses the following expressions about the importance of the correspondence between Cinnah and Iqbal:

“The letters in the compilation contain the opinions of Iqbal about the political future of Indian Muslims. In the preface he wrote, Cinnah shows that he attaches great importance to Iqbal's ideas regarding the political future of India, and he stands out as the person who follows the idea of Pakistan persistently. Cinnah confesses in the preface that these letters are of great importance in the history of Muslim India”²⁴

In his letter to Jinnah, dated 21 June 1937, Muhammad Iqbal went one step further and made use of the following statements regarding the boundaries of the Islamic state that should be established:

“...The question therefore is how is it possible to solve the problem of Muslim poverty? And the whole future of the League depends on the League's activity to solve this question. If the League can give no such promises indifferent to it as before. Happily there is a solution in the enforcement of the Law of Islam and its further development in the light of modern ideas. After a long and careful study of Islamic Law I have come to the conclusion that if this system of Law is properly understood and applied, at last the right to subsistence is secured to everybody. But the enforcement and development of the Shariat of Islam is impossible in this country without a free Muslim state or states. This has been my honest conviction for many years and I still believe this to be the only way to solve the problem of bread for Muslims as well as to secure a peaceful India. If such a thing is impossible in India the only other alternative is a civil war which as a matter of fact has been going on for some time in the shape of Hindu-Muslim riots. I fear that in certain parts of the country, e.g. N.W. India, Palestine may be repeated...”²⁵

²³ Farhan Jehangir, *Letters of Iqbal to Jinnah*, Lahore: Tareef Printers, 2002, 9-10.

²⁴ Celal Soydan, *İkbâl'e Dair*, Ankara: Hece Yayınları, 2016, 196.

²⁵ Farhan Jehangir, *Letters of Iqbal to Jinnah*, Lahore: Tareef Printers, 2002, 23-24.

The political relationship and exchange between Iqbal and Jinnah have led to significant transformations in the basic political principles of Modern India in the short term and Pakistan in the long run. The correspondence between the two provides important clues as to how the Pakistani movement has evolved into a reality through the superior efforts of Jinnah and Iqbal. Allama Muhammad Iqbal's proposal for a solution for Muslims and its future description provided an intellectual basis for the ideologies of Indian Muslims to establish Pakistan. These suggestions have enabled the theory of the Two Nations to reach and be supported by all groups through literary, social, political, religious and cultural channels. The idea of a Islamic state, which centered on the resurgence of Islam, influenced even many Muslim countries that had gone through the collapse phase in the twentieth century, and gave a new dimension to the political structures in India.

Chaudhry Rahmat Ali(1897-1951) is another very important name that makes the two-nation theory and the Pakistani ideology the basis of the future state of Pakistan. Chaudhry Rahmat Ali was able to occupy an important place in the eyes of Indian Muslims both because of his intellectual contribution to the theory of the two nations served for independence and as the creator of the name of Pakistan. Chaudhry Rahmat Ali has taken a nationalist stance since his early days in politics and developed important theories for the establishment of a Muslim state dominated by Islam. Rahmat Ali stated that the Muslim concentration in the western parts of India has the potential to form a new state and stated that this organization could be possible by separating themselves from Hindus and breaking all relations with this nation.²⁶ Emphasizing his criticism of the federal state structure, Rahmat Ali, with a strict interpretation of the theory of the two nations, argued that the Hindu-Muslim whole should be completely separated. Chaudhry Rahmat Ali's most important contribution to the Muslim independence movement was his findings and suggestions in his article Now or Never that he published it in 1933 with his three friends. In the article he co-authored with Sheikh Mohammed Sadik, Muhammad Aslam Khan and Inayatullah Khan, Rahmat Ali made important determinations that would enable Muslims to act jointly and bring Muslim leaders around the Two Nations theory. The most important of these determinations is that Pakistan in their minds includes the Punjab, Northwest Border

²⁶ James Wine Bright, *Tarih-i Pakistan*, çev. Mahmud Şahid Şevket, Lahore: Darulshaour Publications, 2015, 243.

Province, Kashmir, Sindh and Balochistan regions and should build a state where Muslims can live freely within these borders. The statements that Muslims should build a glorious government with a vigorous effort and decide whether it will exist forever or to be a waste and to draw its path according to it have deeply affected Muslim society.²⁷ The following sentences of Rahmat Ali provide important information about the importance of the establishment of an Islamic state within the framework of the two-nation theory:

“...The issue is now or never. Either we live or perish for ever. The future is ours only if we live up to our faith. It does not lie in the lap of the gods, but it rests in our own hands. We can make or mar it. The history of the last century is full open warnings and they are as plain as were ever given to any nation. Shall it be said of us that we ignored all these warnings and allowed our ancient heritage to perish in our own hands?”²⁸

The famous article that envisions comprehensive reforms for Muslims in the Indian Sub-Continent has been recognized as one of the cornerstones of Pakistani ideology and has increased interest for Two Nations Theory. In his article, Rahmat Ali stated that the solution of ethnic and religious problems in India could be possible with the establishment of a Muslim country and he did not hesitate to provide clues about the boundaries of the state to be established. Rahmat Ali reiterated the proposal that the possible state, which was planned to be established in two important articles written between 1933-35, should consist of Punjab, Balochistan, Afghan Province (Northwest Border Province), Kashmir and Sind regions.²⁹ Another important contribution of Chaudhry Rahmat Ali to the establishment process of Pakistan is the reconstruction of the name of Pakistan in an ideological structure. Chaudhry Rahmat Ali created the word Pakistan with nationalist meaning. And he explained this word in the following manner:

“Pakistan is both a Persian and Urdu word. It is composed of letters taken from the names of all our homelands-‘Indian’ and ‘Asian’. That is Panjab, Afghania [North-West Frontier Province] Kashmir. Iran, Sindh (including Kutch and Kathiawar)

²⁷ Nisar Ahmad Kisanoo, *Mutala i Pakistan Aor Çodhiri Rahmat Ali*, Feisalabad: Kuşan Publications, 1997, 142-150.

²⁸ Chaudhry Rahmat Ali, http://chrehmatali.com/books/Now_or_Never.pdf (10.05.2019).

²⁹ Sumit Sarkar, *Cedit-i Hindustan*, çev. Mesud Haşimi, Yeni Delhi: National Council for Promotion of Urdu Language Publications, 2003.

Tukharistan, Afghanistan and Balochistan. It means the land of the Paks-the spiritually pure and clean. It symbolizes the religious beliefs and ethnical stocks of our people and it stands for all the territorial constituents of our original Fatherland”³⁰

Although the ideas of Chaudhry Rahmat Ali, who set out the borders of the planned Muslim country and offered a clever suggestion of what his name was, did not receive the attention expected at the third roundtable conference, he later became the main principles of the ideologies of India's Muslims in establishing a new country. When we talk about Chaudhry Rahmat Ali, it is necessary to mention the following footnote. Rahmat Ali has been quite opposed to Muhammad Ali Jinnah's division plan. He used very harsh statements to Muslim leaders who accepted the division plan prepared by the British.

“When Jinnah and the Muslim League accepted the 3 June Plan Chaudhry Rahmat Ali broke out in invective. He accused Jinnah of shattering the foundations of Muslim nationhood and sabotaging the future of 100 million Muslims living in India. He called the creation of Pakistan ‘the blackest and the bloodiest treachery in our history”(Kazımı, 2019:119).³¹

Rahmat Ali has recently lost popularity and influence in the Muslim community due to his statements about Pakistan's founding and strict rhetoric about Pakistan's founding leader, Mohammed Ali Cinnah.

Mohammed Ali Jinnah, the founder of Pakistan, concluded that the only condition for establishing peace in India was the establishment of an independent Muslim state in the region. Jinnah, who settled in England for a while due to political conflicts in India and dissatisfaction with the scattered structure of Muslims, followed the political developments in India and decided to return to India in 1933 with the effort of his close friend Liyakat Ali Khan. After this time, Jinnah used all his efforts to reorganize the Muslim Party and reach a strong structure and to develop the theory of the Two Nation as a recipe for independence for Muslims. On March 8, 1934, Jinnah, who was elected president of the All India Muslim Party in Mumbai, recognized that

³⁰ M.R. Kazımı, *A Concise History of Pakistan*, Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2019, 119.

³¹ M.R. Kazımı, *A Concise History of Pakistan*, Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2019, 119.

this title did not grant him a bed of roses.³² He has endeavored to imbue Muslims with political tactics and discipline. Instead of dealing with the nationalist repression of the Indian Congress Party of India or the political games of the British, it is very important that Jinnah put the organization of Muslims as his first goal. Because while Mohammed Ali Jinnah was away from active politics in India and followed the developments in London, the All India Muslim Party split into two wings (Aziz Group-Hidayat Group) and these groups organized two different meetings and at the same time, the whole structure of Muslims was disrupted as a result of personal conflicts within the party. For this reason, Muhammad Ali Jinnah has spent all his efforts on the Muslim Party's reintegration of the old holistic structure, and on keeping Muslims' personal interests away from self-interest in order to serve the Pakistani ideology. By joining the All India Muslim Party and becoming president of the party after a while, Jinnah began to take political initiatives to revise the rights of Indian Muslims and the definition of Indian as a supreme identity structure and to accept Muslims as a nation. When Jinnah returned from London, where he exchanged ideas with Iqbal, he adopted the theory of the Two Nations and chose to shape his strategy in the future. Muhammad Ali Jinnah knew that the democratic republic system in western states could not be adapted to India and tried to convince the British that they should govern themselves according to the internal dynamics of Muslims. "He says that the Republican system in Britain will not fit India. Because there, sometimes the Liberal Party governs the government and sometimes the Labor Party is dominated. However, if such a republic structure is implemented in India, the majority Hindu Government always has sovereignty over Muslims and Muslims cannot go beyond being a minority"³³ Jinnah, a clever and cunning politician, wanted to make a logical frame for the British in his view of the uncertainty of why a new state was needed at first with the emphasis of the Two Nations theory and Islam. then, he argued that this state should be designed according to the rules of democracy determined according to its local conditions. According to Jinnah, the establishment of Pakistan will have a direct impact on India's peaceful and peaceful life. Jinnah stated that the possibility of civil war could increase if there was no division. He explained the theory of the two nations to the British and Hindus and explained the necessity of the

³² Riaz Ahmad, *Quaid-i Azam Mohammad Ali Jinnah: Second Phase of His Freedom Struggle 1924-1934*, Islamabad: NIPS Quaid-i Azam University Press, 1994, 228.

³³ Muhammad Ali Çerağ, *Tarih-i Pakistan*, Lahore: Sang-e Meel Publications, 1996, 381.

establishment of Pakistan. Muhammad Ali Jinnah made the following statement about why Pakistan should be established and the differences of Hindus and Muslims:

“The Hindus and Muslims belong to two different philosophies, social customs, literatures. They neither intermarry nor interdine together and, indeed, they belong two different civilizations which are based mainly on conflicting ideas and conceptions. Their concepts on life are different. They have different epics, different heroes, and different episodes. Very often the hero of one is the foe of the other hand, likewise, their victories and defeats overlap. To yoke together two such nations under a single state, one as a numerical minority and the other as a majority, must lead to growing discontent... Mussalamans are a nation according to any definition of nation, and they must have their homeland, their territory and their state.”³⁴

According to Jinnah, the different jurisprudence of Hinduism and Islamic religions does not allow Hindu and Muslims to become one nation. Jinnah transformed Muslim leaders, who had previously been clustered around the idea of Indian nationalism, into advocates serving the theory of the Two Nations. Thus, it prevented the success of the integrated Indian ideologies which Hindus tried to form by melting Muslims in their majority. Jinnah opposed the view that Nehru, the opinion leader of the Hindus, expressed no need for a concept other than British imperialism and Indian nationalism. At the same time, Jinnah firmly stated that there is a Muslim Party and that it protects the rights of Muslims to the fullest and whose existence and power must be recognized.³⁵ Muhammad Ali Jinnah expressed his views on the theory of the Two Nations, which he gave a different structure with his own ideas:

“It is very difficult to tell our Hindu friends the great differences between Islam and Hinduism. These two religions are different in every respect. And the dream of these two nations to live together under one roof has become a story. Misunderstandings and these purposeful practices could one day inflict great damage on India”³⁶ Under the enthusiastic and influential leadership of Muhammad Ali Jinnah, Muslims have made a significant challenge to the efforts of Hindus to pacify themselves with small promises

³⁴Safdar Mahmood, *Pakistan Political Roots&Development 1947-1999*, Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2019, 21.

³⁵ Abdul Majid vdgr., “Genesis of the Two Nations Theory and the Quaid-e-Azam,” *Pakistan Vision Journal* 15, sy.1 (2014):185.

³⁶ Muhammad Ali Çerağ, *Tarih-i Pakistan*. Lahore: Sang-e Meel Publications, 1996, 396-397.

and to gather power in one hand. The fact that Gandhi nationalized the policies of the Congress Party since 1920 and started to create a regime of repression on Muslims in this direction made the Muslims very uncomfortable. Muslims protested this under Jinnah's leadership. Jinnah also stated that they opposed to pushing the Urdu language in the background and emphasizing the use of the Hindi language and emphasized that Urdu language was the national language and that they would never give up speaking and officially using it.³⁷

Jinnah, who knows how important the concept of religion and language is in the formation of a nation, has informed the Muslim community that there must be integration in language. Jinnah also warned the public that they could lose their national consciousness by losing their Urdu language, which is one of the most important factors that would have made them claim to be a nation. In this direction, one of the important innovations that Jinnah brought to the theory of Two Nations was the strategic value that the Urdu language gained in this direction, and with language awareness Muslims were able to gain resistance against the assimilation attempts of Hindus.

Muhammad Ali Jinnah's theory of the Two Nations is based on the claim that Hindu and Muslims will never have a satisfactory quality of life under one rule. The compulsory association of Hinduism and Islam over the centuries has gradually become useless, and the policies of coercion tolerance have led to the mutual separation of the communities of these two beliefs. Jinnah contradicts the Hindu leader Gandhi's idea that Muslims and Hindus are a single nation and therefore must continue to live under a single state, creating common living values. Jinnah stated that the Muslim and Hindu people have so many differences that are unlike any other, and that these differences create two enemies every day rather than two friends, and pointed out the importance of the theory of the Two Nations. Jinnah expressed his views on Hindu-Muslim difference, the importance of the theory of the two nations, and why division is necessary, in the interview with the London News Chronicle on 4th October 1944:

“There is only one practical realistic way of resolving Hindu-Muslim differences. This is to divide India into two sovereign parts of Pakistan and Hindustan and for each of us to trust the other to give equitable treatment to Hindu minorities in

³⁷ Nahid Fatima, *Unnisvin Sadi Mein Urdu Zaban*, Delhi: Adabistan Publications, 2012.

Pakistan and Muslim minorities in India ... the fact is that the Hindu will not reconcile themselves to our complete independence”³⁸

In a letter to Gandhi, Jinnah explained the essence of the two nation theories:

“India is not a nation, nor a country. It is a sub-continent composed of nationalities, Hindus and Muslims being the two major nations”³⁹

Muhammad Ali Jinnah refrained from seeing India as a unified state. On the contrary, he considered that the heterogeneous structure was the biggest obstacle to the holistic evaluation.

³⁸ Abdul Majid vdğr., “Genesis of the Two Nations Theory and the Quaid-e-Azam,” *Pakistan Vision Journal* 15, sy.1 (2014): 188.

³⁹ Farooq Ahmad Dar, “Jinnah and The Lahore Resolution,” *Journal of Research Society of Pakistan* 52, sy. 1 (2015): 130.

Conclusion

Within the framework of these dynamics, the two nation theory soon became the building blocks of Pakistani ideology. The theory of the Two Nations, which is the basis of the formation of the Pakistani ideology, appears to be built on the hypothesis that Muslim and Hindus are two nations that differ from each other in all political, cultural, religious, economic and other socio-social fields. This theory, which constituted the founding theory of Pakistan, enabled the British to understand and adopt the idea that Muslims are a separate and different nation from the Hindu and other Indian peoples, and that they should live their religious and cultural rituals under the Islamic social and political conditions. It has led the British to shape their political policies with these conditions in mind. The rise of this theory has allowed Muslims to unite, creating cracks in the privileged position of the Hindu under British rule. Indian Muslims, who think that Islam is the main determinant of their lives, religiously and socially, and that they should live their daily lives according to the Islamic religious-social order, agree that the only way to realize these demands is to establish a new independent Muslim state. The formation and development of this theory, which enables Muslims to establish a conscious political organization and pay attention to gain under a single party, has been seen as the most important stage of the establishment of Pakistan according to our observations. The increasing authority of the British in the Sub-Continent and the Hindu Nationalist structure of Hindus imposed restrictions on Muslims' living spaces in India. The people, who were shifted from the important executive authorities of the state, whose economic relations were damaged, and most importantly of less value than they deserved as a political identity, found the solution to form a stream of emancipation based on the theory of the Two Nations which presented their idea of an independent state. Syed Ahmad Khan was the first to theorize the theory of the Two Nations, which included the idea of establishing an independent Muslim state, which was supposed to have emerged from the moment Islam began to penetrate the Indian Subcontinent. Syed Ahmad Khan ensured Muslims to have national consciousness as a result of the reforms he had made in the field of education and encouraged them to claim the idea of freedom. This concept of independence, led by Syed Ahmad Khan, was also adopted by India's great philosopher and political actor Muhammad Iqbal and Chaudhry Rahmat

Ali, who encouraged Muslims in many Indian states to build their own states. Another importance of Muhammad Iqbal and Chaudhry Rahmat Ali, who is described as the philosophical guide of the theory, is that these names go one step further than the proposal of an independent state and present the determinations and hypotheses about the regions and states that this state should be in. Muhammad Ali Jinnah, who made the final touches of the two-nation theory and put Muslims in a position where they would not look forward to any proposal other than full independence. In the process following the Lahore Resolution Draft, the entire strategy of Muhammad Ali Jinnah and Indian Muslims were built on the conclusion of the theory of the Two Nations and the rejection of any proposal other than the idea that an independent Muslim state was imposed by this theory.

With the development of the theory, the British began to define Hindu and Muslims as two separate nations. They have given both nations the opportunity to establish an independent state in the Indian Sub-Continent. Thus, Pakistan was established on August 14, 1947 as the first state in the world based on a religion-based nation-state theory.

References

- AHMAD, R., *Quad-i Azam Mohammad Ali Jinnah:Second Phase of His Freedom Struggle 1924-1934*, Islamabad: NIPS Quaid-i Azam University, 1994.
- AMJAD, Y., *Tarih-i Pakistan Vasti Ehed*, Lahor: Sang-e Meel Publications, 1997.
- ASHRAT, V., *Fikriyat-i İkbâl*, Lahore:Sang-e Meel Publications, 2009.
- BRIGHT, J.W., *Tarih-i Pakistan*, çev.Mahmud Şahid Şevket, Lahore: Darulshaour Publications, 2015.
- CHATUVERDI, R., “The Partition of Indian sub-continent: Problems and Literary Prospects,” *Journal of Humanities and Social Science* 17, Sy. 2 (2013): 29-41.
- ÇERAĞ, M. A., *Tarih-i Pakistan*, Lahore: Sang-e Meel Publications, 1996.
- DAR, F.A., “Jinnah and The Lahore Resolution,” *Journal of Research Society of Pakistan* 52, sy.1 (2015): 127-155.
- FATIMA, N., *Unnisvin Sadi Mein Urdu Zeban*, Delhi: Adabistan Publications, 2012.
- JEHANGIR, F., *Letters of Iqbal to Jinnah*, Lahore: Tareef Printers, 2002.
- KAPANİ, M., *Politika Bilimine Giriş*, Ankara:Bilgi Yayınevi, 2009.
- KAZIMI, M.R., *A Concise History of Pakista*, Karachi:Oxford University Press, 2019.
- KIRLANGIÇ, H. “İkbâl’de Gelecek Tasavvuru ve Ne Yapmalı,” *Hece Aylık Edebiyat Dergisi Boyun Eğmeyen Ateşin Dili Muhammed İkbâl Özel Sayısı* 17, sy. 193 (2013): 263-272.
- KISANAO, N. A., *Mutala i Pakistan Aor Çodhiri Rahmat Ali*, Feisalabad: Kuşan Publications, 1997.
- KUYUMCU, H., “Urducannın Gelişiminde Etkin Olan İlk Batılı Eğitim Kurumları ve Aligarh Hareketi,” *Nüşa* VI, sy. 20 (2006): 133-147.
- KUYUMCU, H., *Pakistan Tarihi (1857-1958)*, Konya: Sage Yayıncılık, 2018.

MAHMOOD,S., *Pakistan Political Roots&Development 1947-1999*, Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2019.

MAJID, A., HAMID, A - HABIB, Z., “Genesis of the Two Nations Theory and the Quaid-e-Azam,” *Pakistan Vision Journal* 15, sy. 1(2014):180-192.

MIR, M., *Iqbal*, Lahor: Iqbal Academy Pakistan, 2008.

ÖZCAN, A.B., *Doğu Kültüründe Anlatı Geleneği:Urdu Nesri*, Ankara: Hdy Yayınları, 2012.

SARKAR, S., *Cedid-i Hindustan*, çev. Mesud Haşimi, Yeni Delhi: National Council for Promotion of Urdu Language Publications, 2003.

SAYEED, K.B., *Pakistan the Formative Phase 1857-1948*, Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2019.

SOYDAN, C., *İkbâl’e Dair*, Ankara: Hece Yayınları, 2016.

SULTANA, K., *Politics of the All-India Muslim League 1924-1940*, Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2016.

TABASSUM, H.A., *Felsefe-i İkbâl Aor Neya Pakista*, Faisalabad:Misaal Publishers, 2018.

TISHNA, N. A., *Tarih-i Pakistan 1947-2013*, Celum: Book Corner, 2013.

WASEEM, F., “Sir Sayyid Ahmad Khan and the Identity formation of Indian Muslims through Education,” *Rewiew of History and Political Science* 2, sy. 2 (2014):131-148.

http://chrehmatali.com/books/Now_or_Never.pdf

<https://sozluk.gov.tr/>